

# UNSDCF 2023-2027 Consultation with civil society: Summary

28 March 2022, Park Hotel, Bishkek (+ online)

The UN team hosted a general consultation to validate the UNSDCF 2023-2027 priority areas, outcome and outputs with the current and potential partners among the civil society and activists. The consultation gathered 74 participants, including UN agencies and 49 representatives of CSOs engaged in issues such as human rights, humanitarian aid, women's rights, children's rights, youth, LGBTQ+, interethnic relations, migrants, refugees, peacebuilding, people with disabilities, elderly, environment and climate change, volunteering, charity, activism, education, health, culture, creative economy.

Through group discussions facilitated by UN staff, the civil society representatives provided feedback in form of recommendations to potential activities under each outcome area, as well as general feedback on how the UN System can improve its interaction with the civil society. Notes based on those discussions are presented below in clustered format.

## Civil society's recommendations and suggestions

**Outcome 1<sup>1</sup>. By 2027, the people of the Kyrgyz Republic, particularly vulnerable groups, have enhanced resilience, strengthened capabilities, and access to decent work, resulting in full enjoyment of their rights contributing to the socio-economic development of the country.**

**Output 1.1** National and local policies, plans, budgets, and financing mechanisms are evidence-based and aligned to respond equitably to people's needs in an inclusive, gender responsive and accountable manner.

**Output 1.2** Social services for health, education, social protection, employment, and labor are improved to provide higher quality, taking into account universal accessibility, equity, gender, shock-responsiveness, timeliness, and include mechanisms to report and respond to grievances.

**Output 1.3** The population of the Kyrgyz Republic, especially the most vulnerable, have acquired the skills and knowledge to make positive changes in the social norms of society for a more inclusive, equitable and gender-sensitive environment, and are empowered to participate in all spheres of life and to assert their rights and opportunities.

Thematic area	Notes
<b>Labour and employment</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Pay attention to the informal sector by reducing the share of the informal sector</li><li>• Issue of working conditions</li><li>• Ratification of the ILO convention and adaptation of decent work conditions into local legislation</li><li>• (1.1, 1.3) creation of independent trade unions and freedom of association</li></ul>
<b>Women and gender equality</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Raise the level of education of women</li><li>• Strengthen outreach – women of reproductive age who need knowledge</li><li>• Mandatory training on gender sensitivity and certification of civil servants (legislative initiative) and LSGs</li><li>• Simplify the receipt of social benefits for the birth of a child by women with HIV/AIDS status</li><li>• Horizontal leadership of women</li></ul>

<sup>1</sup> Note these are the versions of the UNSDCF outcomes and outputs formulations as of 25 March 2022.

<b>Healthcare</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Coordination and monitoring of the implementation of national strategies</li> <li>• Implementation and monitoring of regulatory documents</li> <li>• Participation and involvement of civil society through social contracting mechanisms</li> <li>• Coordination of all activities of development partners for the effective use of funds (including the synchronization of donor strategies) – experience in COVID-19</li> <li>• Direct support (including medications)</li> <li>• Drug policy within the EAEU</li> <li>• Participation of LSGs in matters of health and social protection</li> <li>• Provision of migrants and refugees with medicines (including against tuberculosis)</li> <li>• Global Fund – UNDP remained the main beneficiary, not the MoH</li> <li>• Resuming boards of trustees and advisory public councils under government agencies</li> <li>• Public procurement issues</li> <li>• (1.2) One health programme – healthy eating</li> <li>• Registration of early marriages – youth health – marriage at 16</li> <li>• Annual participatory monitoring, including evaluation of the effectiveness of health sector policies with the participation of CSOs and review of evaluation indicators</li> <li>• Elimination of stigma and discrimination in access to health services (reduction of extortion, promotion of anti-discrimination law)</li> <li>• Implementation of innovative approaches in health education</li> </ul>
<b>Education</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educational programmes – to strengthen (quality) education component among schoolchildren on reproductive health issues</li> <li>• Automated data collection on education – include vulnerable groups (children of internal migrants – displacement)</li> <li>• Creation of an accessible (in terms of format and cost) independent system for assessing the quality of education)</li> </ul>
<b>Social services and their accessibility</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Early childhood development, sensitivity of IFI loans to open human capital development services</li> <li>• Lack of state policy on the adaptation of migrant women</li> <li>• Status of children of migrants</li> <li>• Raise the status of social workers and social educators</li> <li>• Legislatively define the concept of “vulnerable groups of the population”</li> <li>• Strengthen parental responsibility</li> <li>• Other groups of the population (except citizens) are excluded from social services of the state (including stateless persons, persons with disabilities, foreigners)</li> <li>• Support for new institutions (Ombudsman and National Center on the Prevention of Torture), including issues of increasing budgets (financing mechanisms)</li> <li>• Digital accessibility of public services and provision of information in an accessible format (PWDs)</li> </ul>
<b>Governance</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Support for law enforcement reforms with good governance principles</li> <li>• Strengthen and monitor programme budgeting</li> <li>• Joint monitoring of international obligations</li> <li>• Delegation of powers of local self-governments in the implementation of social programmes</li> <li>• (1.1) Strengthening the capacity of government agencies (including the Ministry of Education and Science) and reviewing the internal organizational structures of government agencies</li> <li>• Strengthen policy-institution-community mechanisms</li> <li>• Each state body, including LSGs, to raise issues of gender equality</li> <li>• Increasing the attractiveness of state social orders</li> <li>• National and local strategies and policies must be understandable (plain language) as strategies are written in an inaccessible style of presentation and they must be understood by the general population</li> <li>• Adoption of a law on strategic planning (which takes into account calculations for financing mechanisms, ensures the interconnection of the national and local levels)</li> </ul>

<b>Other</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Development of a cultural component to change social norms</li> <li>• Support (legal and social) for young people based on the principle “from youth to youth”</li> <li>• Implement the principles of the UN Special Rapporteur in line with the UN Guiding Principles on Human Rights for Business</li> </ul>
--------------	---

***Outcome 2. By 2027, the well-being of the population of the Kyrgyz Republic will have improved through the further rollout of a green economy based on sustainable and healthy food systems, natural resource management, and effective migration processes, by accelerating the use of innovation and entrepreneurship.***

**Output 2.1** Green economic growth is accelerated through increased entrepreneurship and employment opportunities, including through the sustainable use of natural resources.

**Output 2.2** Food system sustainability is enhanced through a more efficient and inclusive approach that ensures healthy and quality nutrition for the population.

**Output 2.3** An effective system of managing migration processes is introduced to accelerate green socio-economic development.

**Output 2.4** Innovative technologies, including digitalization, are introduced to develop a green and creative economy.

Thematic area	Notes
<b>Innovation and creative economy, human resources</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• (2.4): Lack of policies on innovation and the creative economy, approve a policy or strategic document, where the concept of creative economy can be fixed. Recommendation: pay attention to this area, focus on business and involve business in processes, create initiatives, develop collaborations with business.</li> <li>• An example is bringing together leaders from different countries within the framework of forums, focusing on working with active leaders in the creative economy. Educational component (creative education)</li> <li>• Problem: find qualified personnel, including abroad. Kyrgyzstan can become a transit point for people who are moving due to the crisis. There are opportunities to expand the service sector with a quick response from the authorities. There is a possibility that certain percentage of people would stay here. Necessary to create a bridge, platform programmes to go through a period of transition when a student can gain certain practical skills.</li> <li>• Increase educational, expert staff locally and in the Kyrgyz language. Adapt international technologies to the Kyrgyz language, in particular for local promotion.</li> </ul>
<b>Migration</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Development of an alternative models of migration, elements: migrants, state, trade unions. Key interaction between civil society and government in this area.</li> <li>• Monitor as migration income will decrease. Partnership of civil society and state, to help in the employment of migrants, to open other countries for migration routes. The crisis will greatly affect food security, it is important to hold additional discussions of the civil society and the state, to develop anti-crisis plans.</li> <li>• Validation of the profession of migrants, licensing of knowledge (people do not have certificates, diplomas).</li> <li>• Raise the issue of abandoned children of migrants and increased parental responsibility for raising children.</li> <li>• Necessary to introduce elements of migration law into both school and university curricula; immigration lawyers needed.</li> </ul>
<b>Business</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Business associations as a basis for dialogue with business</li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The role of civil society should focus on monitoring the activities of multinational companies (92 uranium tailings)</li> <li>• Implement “Business and Human Rights” guidelines, if rights are violated, then tools should work in all languages</li> </ul>
<b>Agriculture</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The main problem of small farmers is small-scale production, they spend a lot of time on their business, there is no opportunity to do something else. It is necessary to engage in cooperation – joint purchases and sales. A negative example: the cooperative movement of the 2000s, people have a bad attitude towards the concept of a cooperative. When farmers begin to unite, you can involve them in cooperation and social projects.</li> <li>• There is no cooperation between small and large farmers, because a cooperative is another form of collective farm, people got their freedom when they were 30-40 years old (there is a negative Soviet experience). Young farmers will be more willing to cooperate, as no negative experience.</li> <li>• Despite inefficiency, the form is stable, hunger does not occur. 70% of the population owns land and produces more than 90% of agricultural products. Danger of social explosions due to redistribution of land. Small-scale marketability can be reduced through enlargement (create groups of common interests, create a platform for expansion, for field consultants, also involve the scientific sphere for the joint development of practices), for this the farmers must go bankrupt, the social cost of this is extremely high.</li> <li>• Take measures to popularize the countryside, the production of products on personal plots. Many programmes focus on imports; there are no programmes that focus on domestic products, including legumes. Promote programmes for the use of local products: vegetables, legumes. This can be done through school meals, television programmes, inclusion of social media, with a focus on how to grow and consume local vegetables.</li> <li>• (2.4): Take measures to protect the soil.</li> <li>• Introduce the concept of “climate and women” – receive local grants for women farmers</li> <li>• Develop domestic seed production</li> <li>• Training of farmers is fragmentary, it is necessary to systematize, institutionalize the training of farmers.</li> <li>• (2.1): Concerning universities that help to find a job, the recommendation is to change the work of universities, to reform them. Civil society introduces additional programmes, especially in rural areas, for the formation of “soft” skills. Introduce additional models, involve the Ministry of Education and Science. The provision on academic freedom has already been introduced, it is necessary to encourage universities to academic freedom. Four key areas requiring intervention: access to knowledge, finance, technology, resources. Add vocational schools as an institution that teaches technical professions, focus on this.</li> </ul>
<b>Nutrition</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• It is necessary to popularize the profession of a nutritionist, introduce a specialty for training, there is no nutrition institute that would monitor compliance with standards. Nutritionists in their communities could advise women about nutrition and diet. Local experts, local expertise in general and research are needed.</li> <li>• Amend the law on local self-governance, there is no concept of sustainability, in school meals there is no way to support local producers.</li> <li>• Introduce an applied aspect of nutrition into school education: teach how to make a menu, give practice-oriented tasks.</li> <li>• There are no studies among the adult population, it is necessary to constantly monitor their condition, to revise food safety and nutrition programmes.</li> <li>• Make it a norm for everyone to be able to screen their daily nutrition, connect information technology. Thanks to the applications, there will be access to generalized data, it will be clear in which regions what does not eat up. The applications should have recipes with those products that are not consumed enough for good nutrition.</li> <li>• Promote healthy eating among schoolchildren.</li> <li>• Support smallholder school feeding initiatives, direct contact with producers and consumers.</li> </ul>
<b>Green economy</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The eco-economy agenda is still unattractive for citizens, it is necessary to introduce competitions, collaborations on the environmental agenda</li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There are rarely high-profile articles on the green economy in Kyrgyzstan, on nutrition, it is necessary to promote the topic online</li> </ul>
<b>Other</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Involvement of youth, as well as all vulnerable groups, in initiatives and decision-making</li> <li>• Corporate social responsibility, public-private partnerships, educational institutions are good platforms for interaction. Civil society as a platform for young people who are not involved in various groups.</li> <li>• Discrimination against locals when receiving grants, in order to support small-scale production, a simplified procedure should be introduced in Kyrgyz.</li> <li>• (2.2): It is necessary to strengthen inter-agency cooperation (Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Health), create new joint groups. Ensure sustainability and continuity. Maintain a positive image of NGOs in their work with the population and the state, motivate support for civil initiatives.</li> <li>• Increase the quota for women in local elections.</li> <li>• (2.3): <i>Propiska</i> in many areas hinders employment in other regions. Engagement should involve both locals, foreigners and stateless persons.</li> <li>• Prepare an annual emergency plan.</li> <li>• (2.4): Identify the main players in civil society, involve them in implementation</li> </ul>

***Outcome 3. By 2027, Kyrgyzstan has started the transition to low-carbon development and risk-informed climate resilience, contributing to people’s fair and equitable access to ecosystem benefits and to empowerment of vulnerable communities in the governance of natural resources and disaster prevention.***

**Output 3.1** Climate policy, financing, and awareness mechanisms are designed and implemented that support climate actions, with the full participation of women and men at all decision-making levels.

**Output 3.2** Policies, innovations, and seed investments are developed to ensure inclusive access to sustainable energy solutions in underserved urban and rural areas, with the support of the state and business, and in ways that encourage women’s leadership.

**Output 3.3** Critical ecosystems are better protected throughout the country, and the rational and sustainable use of natural resources, including water and land, is improved through participatory and conflict-sensitive systems at all levels.

**Output 3.4** Capacity of disaster management systems is strengthened, and community resilience to multiple shocks is increased at all levels through effective investments, policies, mechanisms, and tools.

Thematic area	Notes
<b>Awareness about ecological problems</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Raising awareness/information to avoid conflicts over resources</li> <li>• Strengthening the interaction between local self-governance bodies and ministries in order to inform</li> <li>• Inclusion in education programs (both for schoolchildren and secondary vocational and higher education) courses on environmental protection. An example is the “Climate Box”. As well as online courses for the general public, not only on local but also global climate issues.</li> <li>• Politics, practice, culture – development of the cultural component (fairy tales, poems, stories, cartoons)</li> <li>• Development of a friendly format for presenting information on climate issues</li> <li>• Cultural accessibility of environmental topics in the Kyrgyz language, thus increasing the credibility of information on climate issues</li> </ul>

<b>Environment, ecosystems and natural resources</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ensuring public participation in environmental decision-making</li> <li>• Non-transparent separation of the ministries' functions in the field of certain issues (for example, the use of water resources)</li> <li>• Creation and development of funds to support and preserve mountain landscapes</li> <li>• Dialogue between civil society, mining companies in order to increase economic potential and preserve the eco-component</li> <li>• Digitization of the country's ecosystems</li> <li>• Focus on systemic crises (especially uranium trading)</li> <li>• An effective system for protecting human health from zoonotic diseases and ecosystem health has been introduced</li> </ul>
<b>Agriculture</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Use of technology for the agricultural sector</li> <li>• Very often there is a request from local communities to monitor the state of pastures at the national level to determine the exact picture to date, because there is no accurate objective assessment of the state of agricultural land in the country</li> </ul>
<b>Climate change</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Give priority to medium and long-term climate projects</li> <li>• Shift to scaling climate-resilient innovations/technologies to combat drought, manage water resources and land degradation</li> <li>• Increasing the publicity of official climate documents and publications</li> <li>• Improving the quality of climate data</li> <li>• Corporate responsibility for climate change</li> <li>• Involvement of civil society not only in prioritizing areas of work, but also in monitoring</li> </ul>
<b>Energy</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• How to introduce energy saving into the culture of the population</li> </ul>
<b>Other</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Delegated powers for local governments need to be brought to a logical point</li> <li>• (3.2): The formulation should include not only the development, but also the implementation</li> <li>• "better" in the wording – how to measure it?</li> <li>• "capacity strengthened" in the wording – at the expense of what?</li> <li>• (3.3): provide for a digital component (digitalization)</li> <li>• Collaboration of civil society, business and government agencies in order to comply with international standards – adaptation of the ESG concept</li> <li>• Implementation of the 2018 guidelines on business responsibility and human rights</li> <li>• Clearly define what leadership is (not the same as serving women)</li> <li>• Iodine deficiency, the impact of negative factors on reproductive function, problems of exposure to highlands</li> <li>• Balance between excessive state regulation of the market (businesses) and favorable policies)</li> </ul>

***Outcome 4. By 2027, all people in the Kyrgyz Republic enjoy the benefits of fair and accountable democratic institutions that are free from corruption and apply innovative solutions that promote respect for human rights, and strengthen peace and cohesion.***

Output	Notes
<b>Output 4.1: Accountable, participatory, transparent, and effective governance systems at all levels ensure the provision of</b>	<p>General comments:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Questions about terms. For example, what does "national efforts" mean: does it mean only the government or civil society?</li> <li>• What will happen with the proposals of the civil society, will they just be taken into account or will they be reflected in the documents related to the UNSDCF?</li> <li>• A SWOT analysis is needed on the feasibility of the proposed results and how this work is linked to national plans</li> </ul>

**quality services for all and promote social cohesion**

- Is this activity linked to the process of adopting a national human rights plan?
- Socially disapproved groups should also be included in the concept of inclusion

Wishes for activities:

- Strengthening the capacity of government agencies and CSOs to deliver and manage services, especially through improved use of digital data
- Improving the skills and ability of government agencies and CSOs to use various indices
- Digitize social services
- Strengthen media and information literacy, especially in the provision of social services

**Output 4.2:**  
**The system of justice and out-of-court dispute resolution, as well as human rights institutions, ensure the full application of the rule of law, justice, equality, and the fight against corruption.**

- Strengthen the role of independent media in the provision of social services
- Fight against corruption on the basis of ratified international conventions
- Strengthening CSOs in the *kurultai* institute
- All actions of the *kurultai* must comply with the international obligations of the country
- At the LSG level, it is necessary to consider the electoral process, taking into account the gender process
- Improving working conditions for government employees
- Improve the capacity of government employees to work with CSOs or international instruments
- UN Resolution 1325 must work for all
- Digital accessibility and accessible format. Development of digital tools accessible to people with disabilities
- Conduct a gender analysis
- Legal education and legal literacy at all levels
- Alignment and elimination of contradictions in legal acts related to property (for example, ownership of natural resources)
- Monitoring and budgeting the implementation of activities on reproductive rights
- Access to government and other services, regardless of whether you have a residence permit and/or registration
- Implementation of a clear and measurable anti-corruption policy
- Adoption and promotion of anti-discrimination legislation, which will increase the effectiveness of legislation in general
- To improve justice, improve the legal culture of the population, institutions have already been created and legislated, but the population does not know about them or is not in the habit of following them. Legal dispute resolution mechanisms
- Most violations of rights occur among young people in schools and universities. It is necessary to create or strengthen institutions/mechanisms to protect the rights of young people, for example, to protect against corruption in the education system
- A huge problem is violence against young people in schools, colleges and universities. It would be good if the UN would help create a structure for protection from physical and psychological violence.
- Judges lack empathy and human skills, especially in the administration of justice in cases and issues related to women's rights (violence, alimony, etc.). Therefore, a platform is needed where a dialogue on this topic will take place, which includes CSOs, the media.
- Having the independence of the judiciary solves most of the problems in many ways. The need to ensure the openness of the judiciary through the introduction of openness in the activities of judges, which would affect their re-election.
- Advocates promoting clean methods face pressure. A common strategy is needed to protect honest lawyers.
- The UN system should work to build the capacity of the judiciary.
- Improving the system of socially-oriented education of personnel in the justice system and in general in the system of state personnel as a whole.

- Combating impunity through strategic cases and implementation of the decisions of international institutions to combat torture.
- Promoting the work of the Department of Justice, especially its free legal aid work, which is now completely non-functional.
- Integrate digitalization into the justice system, especially to ensure the openness of judicial processes.
- Protection of citizen's rights to health.
- Eliminate stigma and discrimination against people living with HIV, etc.
- Adoption of a comprehensive anti-discrimination NLA
- Creation/strengthening of the "new wave", (online) platform for training civil activists

**Output 4.3:**

**Civil society has the knowledge, skills, and capabilities to exercise their rights, participate in public decision-making, and engage in constructive dialogue to achieve social cohesion, justice and equality.**

- Strengthening the role of NGOs in monitoring and evaluating the activities of state institutions, not only in urban areas and the capital, but also in the regions, especially through e-government efforts.
- Providing knowledge and information to CSOs in an accessible language and format
- It is necessary to strengthen the regional dialogue between CSOs not only within Central Asia, but also beyond. We know well what is happening in Central Asia, but we do not know what is happening in the Caucasus. It is necessary to raise awareness about working with communities and create, strengthen the will to prevent aggression. There is a need for medium and long-term activities to strengthen links between CSOs in the region.
- Promotion of non-toughening of legislation in the field of CSOs.
- Promote the role of CSOs in the development of parliamentarism and demand that parliament pass democratic laws. CSOs need to be assisted in restoring social and economic rights and expanding political and civic space.
- Achievement of development indicators set by the state itself.
- Increasing the capacity of CSOs to competently analyze NLA submitted for public discussion.
- Operationalization of the new human rights plan.
- Human rights information should be available in a variety of formats to different categories of the population, especially the vulnerable.

## Recommendations on UN Systems' work

### General recommendations on UNSDCF:

- The UN system needs to consult with CSOs at the budget planning stage
- Gender mainstreaming should be present in all outcome areas
- Wish to formulate the results immediately in Kyrgyz language

### Recommendations and comments on the work of the UN with civil society:

- Revision of financed projects (due to a decrease in the level of public confidence in development projects);
- Dialogue is needed – consultations between the UN and CSOs (including specific ones);
- The UN system needs to strengthen cooperation on the ground (move away from national implemented projects);
- Pay attention to monitoring;
- Non-execution of the tender approach;
- Increasing the capacity of civil society organizations to independently attract investments in priority areas;
- Pay attention to youth and education – capacity building in civil society (connection of eco-activists, journalists, business);
- Timely response of the UN System to the situation on various politically sensitive situations;
- When choosing civil defense institutions for cooperation, choose those who work at the national level, providing a multilateral view of the situation, from the point of view of regional mentality; the most effective format is the



joint implementation of activities, where the level of responsibility of the parties, in particular local communities, is increased;

- Work through projects, themes, initiatives, sites where you can express interest, social movements and platforms; an example is the international food security forum, the moderator draws up proposals in the form of recommendations; the recommendation is to create such a multilingual platform and disseminate it;
- The UN system also to go to business, work through business associations; to popularize examples of businesses that are engaged in social projects; recommendation – joint management and financing of projects by business and the UN, joint training with business associations, example – Umut; establishing a campaign with dairy processors and WFP to provide hot meals in schools;
- To provide information about the events held by the UN and the state in an accessible format for people with disabilities;
- Support income generating projects and activities;
- Make writing projects more accessible and simpler;
- Provide expert support to young people, start-ups, in particular from the state and the UN in the framework of the implementation of environmental projects;
- UN recognition of the role of CSOs and improvement in the (joint) results storytelling;
- Ensuring complementarity between the activities of the UN and CSOs.